Turkish Studies
International Periodical For The Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic
Volume 10/6 Spring 2015, p. 449-458
DOI Number: http://dx.doi.org/10.7827/TurkishStudies.7986
ISSN: 1308-2140, ANKARA-TURKEY

ÇEVİRİ HİZMETLERİ ETİK KODLAR METİNLERİNDE SÜRDÜRÜLEBİLİRLİK*

*Oktay ESER***

ÖZET

Çeviri, gerek yazılı gerekse sözlü olsun tarih boyunca insanlar arası iletişimde önemli bir rol oynamıştır. Toplumda ürünler çok çeşitli biçimlerde tüketicilere sunulmaktadır. Çeviri işletmeleri ise bu ürünler içinde hizmet olarak yer almaktadır. İşletmeler, hizmet sundukları tüketicilerden çalışanlarına ve genelde ise topluma olmak üzere paydaşlarına karşı sorumludurlar. Yaptıkları işin merkezine müşterileri koymak durumundadırlar. Aksi halde başarısız olabilirler. Bir değer yaratarak müşterileri ile ileriye dönük ilişkiler geliştirmeli ve onlardan değer görmelidirler. Sürdürülebilirlik, kavram olarak bugünün müşterilerinin ihtiyaçlarının ötesine geçmektedir. Çeviri işletmeleri, başarıları ve devamlılıklarıyla da yarının müşterilerini önemsediklerini göstermelidirler. Çeviri işletmeleri, tüm dünyadan tüketici pazarlarından kurumsal pazarlara küresel pazarlardan kamu pazarlarına kadar çok çeşitli pazarlara hizmet veren bir sektörde hizmet vermektedirler. Bu hizmetlerin sağlanmasında tüketicinin ve toplumun uzun vadeli beklentilerini göz ardı etmek, onlara karşı bu hizmetlerin sunulamaması anlamına gelmektedir. Çeviri hizmetleri, birey, kurum ve toplum boyutlarında sürdürülebilir olmalıdır. Bu yazının temel amacı, çeviri sektöründeki bulunan federasyonlar ve derneklerin geliştirdiği etik kodlar metinlerinde sürdürülebilirlik kavramını betimlemektir. Bulgular, çeviri hizmetleri etik kodlar metinlerinde sürdürülebilirlik kavramının doğrudan gönderme yapılan bir kavram olmadığını göstermektedir. Özellikle bireysel ve kurumsal boyutlarda dolaylı olarak ifadelere rastlanmaktadır. Ancak, toplumsal boyut, toplumun bugünü kadar yarınını da içerecek şekilde bir vurgu gözlemlenmektedir. Çeviri hizmetleri, odağını çevirmen ve müşteri olmak kadar bir pazar içinde ürün üzerine yöneltirse sürdürülebilirlik daha görünür olabilir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Çeviri, Hizmet, Sürdürülebilirlik, Etik Kodlar, ATA, FIT, AUSIT, EN-15038, ITI

---

* **Bu makale Crosscheck sistemi tarafından taranmış ve bu sistem sonuçlarına göre orijinal bir makale olduğu tespit edilmiştir.**

** Yrd. Doç. Dr. Amasya Üniversitesi, Eğitim Fakültesi, İngiliz Dili Eğitimi, El-mek: oktayeser@hotmail.com

'SUSTAINABLE' CODES OF ETHICS IN TRANSLATION SERVICES

STRUCTURED ABSTRACT

The paper entitled "Sustainable' Codes of Ethics in Translation Services" is based on the codes of ethics suggested by prominent federations and associations in the Translation **industry** such as ATA, FIT, AUSIT, EN-15038, ITI. Throughout history, written and spoken translations have played a crucial role in interhuman communication. Of all the different types of entities marketed in society, translation and interpreting businesses offer services as a market offering. Businesses fail, but they have a responsibility within themselves and towards others including the society for today and tomorrow. They must make sure that they will be in the market in the years to come. About 33 % of the new US companies that were established in 2010 failed in their first 2 years (SBA, 2014:2). There is a reason for every failure. They may run out of money or the market may change. However, they need to be organized make services sustainable. Companies must put the customer at the heart of the business. They have to create value and build relationships with their customers. This is why sustainability is so important. It is a concept that goes beyond caring for the needs and wants of today's customers. It means having concern for tomorrow's customers in assuring the survival and success of the business, shareholders, employees, and the broader world in which they all live. Sustainable businesses provide the context in which companies can build profitable customer relationships by creating value *for* customers in order to capture value *from* customers in return - now and in the future (Kotler and Armstrong, 2011:608). Translation and interpreting are services as a market offering because services are first sold and then produced and consumed, as compared to goods. They are high in experience and credence qualities. These services are essentially intangible. Whether public or private or whether individual or organizational, these services must be managed in a sustainable way. The main objective of this paper is to describe the codes of ethics in the translation and interpreting industry in terms of the concept of sustainability. Research was conducted through a content-analysis method of the codes of ethics put forward by organizations that govern the translation business and draw conclusions. Followed by a descriptive analysis of the content, sustainability was assessed through a model of three levels of sustainability suggested by Elena and Curiel on the dimensions of individual concerns, organizational concerns, and societal concerns. Elena and Curiel highlight that the ultimate goal of sustainable development is securing a better quality of life for all, both now and for future generations. **The findings indicate that s**ustainability in translation services is not a concept referred directly in the codes of ethics described above, but inherent intrinsically in terms of such dimensions as individual and organizational. However, the societal dimension taking into account the present and future of society is not yet emphasized properly. Sustainability can act as a determining factor visible in the codes of ethics relating to translation industry. In order to do so, there can be a change in focus. The focus seems to be on

the translator, the association or the client. Indeed, these constituents are all the key players. If the focus were placed on translation and interpreting as a product in the translation market, then they would all be sustainably functional. Entities marketed in society differ from goods to services and from ideas to persons. Translation and interpreting are services as a market offering. As a m**a**tter of fact, it must be the service that is sustainable. Sustainable businesses build customer relationships by creating value *for* customers in order to capture value *from* customers in return - now and in the future. Translation businesses have an economic, legal and societal responsibility towards stakeholders such as customers, employees and the community. Society involves everybody and the greater economy. In this way, they can promote a high standard of ethics and values. If companies or persons delivering these services neglect the long-run interests of consumers and society, this can be regarded as a disservice to them. Services must be desirable products with immediate appeal and long-run benefits. The concept of managing these services in a sustainable way is not only to manage in an efficient and effective way, but also to respond strategically to a wide range of environmental and societal challenges.

Key Words: Translation, Interpreting, Service, Sustainability, Code of Ethics, ATA, FIT, AUSIT, EN-15038, ITI

1. Introduction

Businesses fail, but they have a responsibility within themselves and towards others including the society for today and tomorrow. They must make sure that they will be in the market in the years to come. About 33 % of the new US companies that were established in 2010 failed in their first 2 years (SBA, 2014:2). There is a reason for every failure. They may run out of money or the market may change. However, they need to be organized make services sustainable.

Companies must put the customer at the heart of the business. They have to create value and build relationships with their customers. This is why sustainability is so important. It is a concept that goes beyond caring for the needs and wants of today's customers. It means having concern for tomorrow's customers in assuring the survival and success of the business, shareholders, employees, and the broader world in which they all live. Sustainable businesses provide the context in which companies can build profitable customer relationships by creating value *for* customers in order to capture value *from* customers in return - now and in the future (Kotler and Armstrong, 2011:608).

There are different types of entities marketed in society. Translation and interpreting are services as a market offering. This is so because services are first sold and then produced and consumed, as compared to goods. They are high in experience and credence qualities. These services are essentially intangible. Whether public or private or whether individual or organizational, these services must be managed in a sustainable way. The main objective of this paper is to describe the codes of ethics offered by some federations and associations in the translation and interpreting industry in terms of the concept of sustainability. I use the concept of translation service in such a way that it covers translation and interpreting services unless otherwise stated.

2. Literature Review

In literature review, I intend to focus on the concepts of services, ethics, and sustainability. In services marketing, there are some basic terms which needs to be defined in order to understand customers and the marketplace are *customer needs*, *wants*, *demands* and *market offerings*. Companies share a common goal. It is all about creating customer value and building profitable customer relationships. It starts with understanding consumer needs and wants, , and developing a value proposition by which the organization can attract and grow valued consumers (Kotler and Armstrong, 2011:XVI-XVII). **Needs** are the basic human requirements such as air, food and clothing. Human needs are states of felt deprivation. They include basic *physical* needs for food, clothing, warmth, and safety; *social* needs for belonging and affection; and *individual* needs for knowledge and self-expression. These needs become **wants** when they are directed to specific objects that might satisfy the need. They are shaped by society and individual personality **Demands** are wants for specific products backed by an ability to pay (Kotler and Armstrong, 2011:6-22).

A product is defined as (Kotler and Armstrong, 2014:248)

"anything that can be offered to a market for attention, use or consumption that maight satisfy a want or need."

Products are a key element in the overall market offering as consumers' needs and wants are fulfilled through **market offerings**, which are not limited to physical *products* only. They also include *services*. As a matter of fact, there are 10 types of market offerings: Goods, services, events, experiences, persons, places, properties, organizations, information, and ideas. A market offering can be both tangible goods and services. **Services** are a form of product that consists of activities, benefits, or satisfactions offered for sale that are essentially intangible and do not result in the ownership of anything. Services have grown rapidly in recent years. They account for about 64 % of the gross world product.

Ethics is the principles, values, and beliefs that define right and wrong decisions and behavior (Buning and Yu, 2004:477). People who lack a strong moral sense are much less likely to do the wrong things if they're constrained by rules, policies, job descriptions, or strong cultural norms that disapprove of such behaviors. Conversely, intensely moral individuals can be corrupted by an organizational structure and culture that permits or encourages unethical practices (Sturdivant, 1985:128). A **code of ethics** as a formal statement of an organization's values and the ethical rules can play an important role in employees taking ethical decisions for the comapany and society. Uncertainty about what is and is not ethical can be a problem for employees and it can reduce that ambiguity. Research shows that 97 percent of organizations with more than 10,000 employees have a written code of ethics. Even in smaller organizations, nearly 93 percent have one (Weinstein, 2005:15). And codes of ethics are becoming more popular globally. Research by the Institute for Global Ethics says that shared values such as honesty, fairness, respect, responsibility, and caring are pretty much universally embraced (Fleming, 2005:4).

The idea of '**sustainability**' has been the subject of extensive discussion and debate. Ethics are a cornerstone of sustainable relationships. In the long run, unethical actions harms customers and society as a whole). Sustainability continues to evolve. It is a business megatrend. It means development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. However, core elements feature (National Sustainability Council, 2013:9):

- Sustainability is concerned with the future and with the ability to maintain certain values, assets or capabilities over the long term.

- Sustainability involves decisions that address the interaction between environmental, social and economic domains.

- Sustainability requires choices considering equity within society and across generations.

Sustainability is an ability to achieve goals and increase value by integrating economic, environmental, and social opportunities. The concept of managing in a sustainable way, which has the effect of widening responsibility not only to managing in an efficient and effective way, but also to responding strategically to a wide range of environmental and societal challenges. Sustainability calls for socially and environmentally responsible actions that meet the present needs of consumers and businesses while also preserving or enhancing the ability of future generations to meet their needs (Kotler and Armstrong, 2011:582). Elena and Curiel highlight that the ultimate goal of sustainable development is securing a better quality of life for all, both now and for future generations, by pursuing responsible economic growth, equitable social progress, and effective environmental protection. There are three levels of sustainability which encompasses individual, organizational and societal concerns. These three dimensions refer to a sustainable society (Elena and Curiel, 2012:2). Research shows that organizational sustainability is closely related to societal sustainability (Demir and Sezgin, 2014:714).

Translation and interpreting services is a service industry which attracts customers from all kinds of markets from consumer markets to business markets and from global markets to governmental markets. Whether public or private, customers' needs and wants are fulfilled through these services in the translation market. Translation and interpreting services are not a market that can be neglected. Throughout history, written and spoken translations have played a crucial role in interhuman communication. The language services industry is global in nature, with over 25,000 organizations that provide Language Service Providers (LSPs) in 152 countries. Translation is a flourishing industry with on-going signs of growth every year. The global market for outsourced translation and interpreting services and technology is expected to surpass 37 Billion US dollars in 2014, according to the *Annual Review of the Translation, Localization, and Interpreting Services Industry* (DePalma, 2014). In 2013, the global language services industry market size reached 34.78 billion U.S. dollars and was forecasted to rise to 47 billion by 2018 (Statista, 2014). The distribution of the global language services market in 2014 by region holds that North America held a 37.81 percent share of the global language services market, the second largest after Europe with a 51.09 per cent share. Asia was the third with a share of 9.96 per cent. Research found that the demand for language services continues, and is growing at an annual rate of 6.23%. The report indicates that the fastest-growing services in the translation industry are translation, website globalization, software localization, and on-site interpreting.

Any human activity requires translation and interpreting services if the parties in these activities do not share a common language and they have a need to communicate (Mulayim and Lai, et.al., 2015:XXXVI). Having access to translation and interpreting services is considered to be a human right defined in the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR). The rights to liberty and security, and to a fair trial are fundamental human rights protected by the European Convention on Human Rights. For instance, Article 6(3)(a) and (e) of the European Convention on Human Rights state that everyone charged with a criminal offence has the following as the minimum rights (ECHR, 2010:7-8):

(a) to be informed promptly, in a language which he understands and in detail, of the nature and cause of the accusation against him;

(e) to have the free assistance of an interpreter if he cannot understand or speak the language used in court.

Beyond written laws and regulations, businesses are also governed by social codes and rules of professional ethics as an increased emphasis must be placed on ethics and socially responsible actions as written regulations can not be expected to cover all potential abuses, and existing laws are often difficult to enforce. Professions organize themselves into "societies". They sanction members if found guilty of violating "codes of ethics". While the codes of ethics of professional societies differ from each other in some important respects, most of them share some important similarities. An ethical professional will:

1- serve her client's best interests.

2- protect the public.

3- preserve client confidentiality.

4- avoid conflicts of interest, and

5- avoid certain malicious acts toward other members of one's profession.

In delivering translation and interpreting services, professional ethics is of great importance as it can foster trust in companies by promoting ethical standards. Like many global companies have a written corporate values statement called the Code of Ethics towards stakeholders, the translation and interpreting industry, too, has the federations and associations that offer codes of ethics through which they create values that influence relationships and ethical decisions.

3. Methodology of the Research

3.1. *Objectives and Restrictions of the Research*

The main objective of the research aims to describe the codes of ethics and draw conclusions in terms of sustainability. The codes of ethics put forward by organizations that govern the translation business today are as follows:

- **Translator's Charter** by FIT (Fédération Internationale des Traducteurs - International Federation of Translators)

- **EN 15038 European Quality Standard for Translation Services** by CEN (Comité Européen de Normalisation - European Committee for Standardization)

- **Code of Ethics and Professional Practice** by ATA (American Translators Association)

- **Code of Ethics and Code of Conduct** by AUSIT (Australian Institute of Interpreters and Translators)

- **Code of professional conduct** by ITI (Institute of Translation & Interpreting)

3.2. *Variables of the Research*

Research will be conducted through a content-analysis method. Followed by a descriptive analysis of the content, sustainability will be assessed through a model of three levels of sustainability suggested by Elena and Curiel in general as shown below.

Sustainablity dimensions:

- Individual concerns

- Organizational concerns

- Societal concerns

Sustainability is most effective if businesses develop strategies in all of its dimentions. Elena and Curiel highlight that the ultimate goal of sustainable development is securing a better quality of life for all, both now and for future generations. Therefore, I will intend to include the time factor into the research. The factors of time of sustainability are:

- Present
- Future

4. Findings

4.1. Translator's Charter

FIT (Fédération Internationale des Traducteurs - International Federation of Translators)

It consists of 5 sections and 40 statements. It lays down certain general principles in relation to the profession of translating. It was approved by the Congress at Dubrovnik in 1963 ans amended in Oslo in 1994. In Section I, it lays down the general obligations of the translator. This is where the job description is made, focusing on the responsibilities of the translator. It seems to be source-oriented as it discusses the concepts of faithfulness and fidelity in terms of the source text. The main competencies that a translator needs to have in order to translate are bi-lingual and thematic. It also mentions obligations towards the author of the source text, the profession, themselves and consumers by respecting their interests. Section II is about the rights of the translator. A translator is the holder of copyright and the legal protection. Section III treats of the economic and social position of the translator. Translator's Charter deals with renumeration and social security. Section IV highlights translators' societies and unions. It is about defending the interests of the translator and improving the standards of translation through these organizations. They maintain relations with various parties such as industrial organziations, public and private authorities, universities and research institutes. They do so to solve their common problems, assure quality or sort out disputes. They make efforts to value the profession. In Section V, there are statements about national organizations and the international federation of translators. It focuses on the part that FIT plays. Translators are encouraged to establish a national organization which, in turn, is called upon to unite in FIT.

4.2. EN 15038 European Quality Standard for Translation Services

CEN (Comité Européen de Normalisation - European Committee for Standardization)

EN-15038 European Quality Standard for Translation Services was completed in 2006. The purpose of the standard is to establish and define the requirements for the provision of quality services by translation service providers. It encompasses the core Translation process and all other related aspects involved in providing the service. The standard aims to offer translation service providers and clients a description and definition of the service. It also provides them with a set of procedures to meet the market needs. It has six articles consisting of some provisions. The first two articles mention the scope, and the terms and definitions. Article three is about the basic requirements for a translation service provider to carry out a translation project from human resources and competencies to technical resources, and from quality management system to project management. The fourth article is about the client-translation service provider relationship. It deals with enquiry and feasibility, quotation, client-translation service provider agreement, and project conclusion. The fifth article points out the procedures in translation services. It documents procedures about managing translation projects and project preparation from administrative to technical and linguistic aspects. It also gives information on the translation process like translation,

checking, revision, review, proofreading and final verification. The last article regulates the added value services.

4.3. Code of Ethics and Professional Practice

ATA (American Translators Association)

ATA aims to provide a framework to enable a deeper understanding of the effects of professional conduct on members and the industry as a whole. The Code of Ethics and Professional Practice has eight statements accepted by the members as their ethical professional duty. Members are obliged to convey meaning between people and cultures faithfully, accurately, and confidentially. They have to hold in confidence and any privileged information. They must represent their qualifications and responsibilities honestly. They enhance these by continuing education in language, subject field, and professional practice. They act collegially by sharing knowlwdgw and experience. They define in advance by mutual agreement, and abide by the terms of all business transactions among members and with others. They offer due recognition of their work. They endeavor in good faith to resolve among members any dispute that arises from their professional interactions. These statements are intended to protect members, the American Translators Association or those they serve.

4.4. Code of Ethics and Code of Conduct

AUSIT (Australian Institute of Interpreters and Translators)

AUSIT was founded in 1987. The AUSIT Code of Ethics and Code of Conduct was completed in 1995. In 2012, it was updated in recognition of the significant development and diversification of the field in Australia and the growing attention to ethical issues in interpreting and translation around the world. It is intended to regulate the professional conduct of members of AUSIT. A large number of agencies, institutions and purchasers of interpreting and translation services within Australia require practitioners to adhere to this Code of Ethics. Members are obliged to maintain impartiality, objectivity and confidentiality. They strive for excellence through professional development. They decline work beyond tehir competence. They promote working conditions and relationships that facilitate collaboration and quality service delivery. They adhere to dispute resolution procedures. The AUSIT Code of Ethics defines the values and principles guiding the decisions that interpreting and translation professionals make. The Code of Ethics consists of general principles which is made up of nine provisions from professional conduct to confidentiality and from competence to professional development. These provisions set out the values and principles relating to interpreting and translation practice. The AUSIT Code of Conduct provides a framework for interpreting and translation professionals to use when exercising judgment in their practice. It has conduct issues specific to translators with ten provisions and interpreters with fifteen provisions respectively.

4.5. Code of Professional Conduct

ITI (Institute of Translation & Interpreting)

The Code of Professioanl Conduct is made up of 5 different articles under which there are some provisions. The first article deals with a fundamental principle about the members of the institute. They must act in accordance with the high standards of the profession in all cases. The second article defines some terms such as member, principal, and work. The third article is about the standards of conduct that members must follow in relation to advertising, mutual assistance, dispersion of work, explotation of knowledge, confidentiality and media and public statements. Members are expected to act with dignity and professionalism. The fourth article are about the standards of work. The standards of translation and interprerting are set forth. The competencies

that members need to have are defined and the importance of professional development are stressed out. The contractual arrangements are drawn up to highlight the relations between members and principals. There are some provisions which emphasize some exceptions in accepting work from a principal. The last article takes on general provisions about professional standards committee, application of the code, arbitration, disciplinary proceedings and amendment of the provisions.

5. Discussion

Sustainability in translation services is not a concept referred directly in the codes of ethics described above, but inherent intrinsically in terms of such dimensions as individual and organizational. However, the societal dimension taking into account the present and future of society is not yet emphasized properly.

Sustainability can act as a determining factor visible in the codes of ethics relating to translation industry. In order to do so, there can be a change in focus. The focus seems to be on the translator, the association or the client. Indeed, these constituents are all the key players. But, if the focus were placed on translation and interpreting as a product in the translation market, then they would all be sustainably functional. Entities marketed in society differ from goods to services and from ideas to persons. Translation and interpreting are services as a market offering. As a metter of fact, it must be the service that is sustainable. Sustainable businesses build customer relationships by creating value *for* customers in order to capture value *from* customers in return - now and in the future. Translation businesses have an economic, legal and societal responsibility towards stakeholders such as customers, employees and the community. Society involves everybody and the greater economy. In this way, they can promote a high standard of ethics and values. If companies or persons delivering these services neglect the long-run interests of consumers and society, this can be regarded as a disservice to them. Services must be desirable products with immediate appeal and long-run benefits.

The concept of managing these services in a sustainable way is not only to manage in an efficient and effective way, but also to respond strategically to a wide range of environmental and societal challenges.

REFERENCES

Administration’s Office of Advocacy
http://www.sba.gov/sites/default/files/files/_All%20States%2013.pdf

ATA (American Translators Association). *Code of Ethics and Professional Practice*.

AUSIT (Australian Institute of Interpreters and Translators) (2012) Code of Ethics and Code of Conduct.

BUNNİN, Nicholas and YU, Jiyuan (2004). *The Blackwell Dictionary of Western Philosophy*, Malden, USA, Oxford, UK, Victoria, Australia: Balckwell Publishing

CAVAGNARO, E. and CURİEL, G. (2012). *The Three Levels of Sustainability*, Greenleaf Publishing Publication

CEN (Comité Européen de Normalisation - European Committee for Standardization) (2006). *EN 15038 European Quality Standard for Translation Services*

DEMİR, Ö.and SEZGİN, E. E. (2014). Aile İşletmelerinde Kurumsallaşma ve Sürdürülebilirlik: TRB1 Bölgesinde Yapılan Bir Araştırma. *Turkish Studies - International Periodical For*

The Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic. Volume 9/5 Spring, p. 707-725, Ankara – Turkey.

DEPALMA, D. A. et. al. (2014) *The Language Services Market: 2014*. Cambridge: Common Sense Advisory, Inc.

European Court of Human Rights. (2010). *European Convention on Human Right,* Strasbourg. Retrieved from http:// www.echr.coe.int

FIT (Fédération Internationale des Traducteurs - International Federation of Translators). *Translator's Charter*

Fleming, J. E. (2005). "Codes of Ethics for Global Corporations," *Academy ofManagement News*, June.

ITI (Institute of Translation & Interpreting). *Code of Professional Conduct*

KOTLER, P. & ARMSTRONG, G. (2011). *Principles of marketing*, 14th Edition. Pearson Prentice Hall

KOTLER, P. & ARMSTRONG, G. (2014). *Principles of Marketing*, 15th Edition. Pearson Prentice Hall

MULAYİM, S. and LAİ, M. et.al. (2015). *Police Investigative Interviews and Interpreting: Context, Challenges, and Strategies*, London and New York: CRC Press.

National Sustainability Council. (2013). *Sustainable Australia Report 2013: Conversations with the future*, Canberra: DSEWPaC

PWC (2012). Translation Bureau Benchmarking and Comparative Analysis Final Report

SBA (2014). *Small Business Profiles for the States and Territories*, U.S. Small Business

STURDİVANT, F. D. (1985). *Business and Society: A Managerial Approach*, 3rd ed. Homewood, IL: Richard D. Irwin

WEİNSTEİN, M. (2005). "Survey Says: Ethics Training Works," *Training*, November.

Citation Information/Kaynakça Bilgisi

ESER, O., Çeviri Hizmetleri Etik Kodlar Metinlerinde Sürdürülebilirlik, ***Turkish Studies*** - *International Periodical for the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic* Volume 10/6 Spring 2015, p. 449-458, ISSN: 1308-2140, www.turkishstudies.net, DOI Number: http://dx.doi.org/10.7827/TurkishStudies.7986, ANKARA-TURKEY